Sociedad Española de Historia de la Educación

ISSN: 2444-0043

DOI: 10.5944/hme.18.2023.36030



# LOOMING DEPROFESSIONALIZATION: STATE INTERVENTIONS INTO THE OPERATION OF PROFESSIONAL INSTITUTIONS OF SECONDARY TEACHER TRAINING IN HUNGARY IN THE EARLY TWENTIES\*

Desprofesionalización en ciernes: intervenciones estatales en el funcionamiento de las instituciones profesionales de formación del profesorado de secundaria en Hungría a principios de los años veinte

### Imre Garaia

Reception date: 05/11/2022 • Acceptation date: 11/04/2023

**Abstract.** In the paper, the transformation processes of secondary teacher training in Hungary are examined through the investigation of personal and conceptual changes related to two professional institutions, namely the Secondary Teacher Training Institution and the Secondary Teacher Examination Committee in Hungary in the early 1920s.

By employing the method of document analysis of archival sources, substantial amount of primary sources were involved in the research from various archives. Additionally, the secondary literature review is also used as a research method in contextualizing the findings of the analysis. As for the interpretation, notions related to the critical approach of professionalization theories are applied in the paper.

The study gives a brief overview of the development of professional institutions from the mid of the nineteenth century to 1919 in order to provide an insight into some of the main barriers of their development,

**How to cite this article**: Gari, Imre. "Looming deprofessionalization: State interventions into the operation of professional institutions of secondary teacher training in Hungary in the early twenties". *Historia y Memoria de la Educación* 18 (2023): \*\*\*-\*\*\*

<sup>\*</sup> This paper was supported by the János Bolyai Research Scholarship of the Hungarian Academy of Sciences.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>a</sup> Research Group for Historical, Theoretical and Comparative Pedagogy, Faculty of Education Eötvös Loránd University. Kazinczy street 23-27. 1075, Budapest, Hungary. garai.imre@ppk.elte.hu. b https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7129-7807

which expected to be solved by the new regime in Hungary solidified after 1920. The appointment of new leadership in the teacher training institution, the influence on its curriculum, the forced interrogation of the political views of teacher candidates delegated to the teacher examination committee before the state examination and the determination of the reform of the teacher examination regulations all suggest that the state intention of reshaping the teacher training according to circumstances of the new political-social reality after the war resulted in a new relationship between the state and the professional institutions that could lead to deprofessionalization on the long term. This development could be regarded as an unprecedent phenomenon compared to the situation of professionals in other countries in the Central and Eastern European region.

**Keywords:** Professionalization; Secondary teacher training; Deprofessionalization, State interventions.

**Resumen.** En este artículo se examinan los procesos de transformación de la formación del profesorado de secundaria en Hungría a través de la investigación de los cambios personales y conceptuales relacionados con dos instituciones profesionales, a saber, la Institución de Formación del Profesorado de Secundaria y el Comité de Examen del Profesorado de Secundaria en Hungría a principios de la década de 1920.

Mediante el empleo del método de análisis documental de fuentes archivísticas, se incluye en la investigación una cantidad sustancial de fuentes primarias procedentes de diversos archivos. Además, la revisión de la literatura secundaria también se utiliza como método de investigación para contextualizar las conclusiones del análisis. En cuanto a la interpretación, en el trabajo se aplican nociones relacionadas con el enfoque crítico de las teorías de la profesionalización.

El estudio ofrece una breve panorámica del desarrollo de las instituciones profesionales desde mediados del siglo XIX hasta 1919 con el fin de proporcionar una visión de algunos de los principales obstáculos de su desarrollo, que esperaban ser resueltos por el nuevo régimen en Hungría establecido después de 1920. El nombramiento de nuevos directivos en la institución de formación del profesorado, la influencia en su plan de estudios, el interrogatorio forzoso de las opiniones políticas de los candidatos a profesores delegado en el comité de examen de maestros antes del examen estatal y la determinación de la reforma del reglamento de examen de profesores sugieren que la intención estatal de remodelar la formación del profesorado de acuerdo con las circunstancias de la nueva realidad político-social tras la guerra dio lugar a una nueva relación entre el Estado y las instituciones profesionales que podría conducir a la desprofesionalización a largo plazo. Esta evolución podría considerarse un fenómeno sin precedentes en comparación

con la situación de los profesionales en otros países de la región de Europa Central y Oriental.

**Palabras clave:** Profesionalización, Formación del profesorado de secundaria, Desprofesionalización, Intervenciones estatales.

#### INTRODUCTION

Throughout the current study, the claim in the title of the paper will be examined whether deprofessionalization process could be observed in the professional training of secondary school teachers in Hungary during the interwar period. This thought slightly contradicts the general perception of the status of secondary school teachers in the current Hungarian secondary literature, which conveys the idea that despite the political interrogations in the early 1920s which resulted in the dismissal of more than 25.0001 public servants including several secondary teachers and the obvious decrease of the social status of young secondary teachers in the early stage of their professional career,<sup>2</sup> the secondary teacher profession managed to spare and leverage their ideological function across different political regimes.<sup>3</sup> To offer a different approach to the professional development of the schoolteachers, I specify the theoretical background of my research paying special attention to the critical approach of professional theories and the explanation of the notion of deprofessionalization within it. Then, a brief insight into the sources and the methods of the research is provided for the reader. In the second part, the institutionalization of the training of secondary school

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Imre Pornói, «Az 1920-as évek Népoktatása és a nyolcosztályos népiskola Magyarországon» [Public Elementary Schooling in the 1920s and the Implementation of 8-grade Elementary Schools in Hungary], *Magyar Pedagógia* 3-4 (1995): 318.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Gábor Gyáni, «Magyarország társadalomtörténete a Horthy-korban» [The History of the Hunarian Society in the Horthy-era], in *Magyarország társadalomtörténete a reformkortól a második világháborúig* [The History of the Hungarian Society form the early 19<sup>th</sup> century to the end of the World War II.], eds. Gábor Gyáni and Kövér Gyögy (Budapest: Osiris Kiadó, 2006), 281-282.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Andor Ladányi, *A középiskolai tanárképzés története* [History of the Secondary School Teachers] (Budapest: Új Mandátum Kiadó, 2008); András Németh, *Magyar pedagógusképzés és szakmai tudásformák I. 1775-1945. Nemzeti fejlődési trendek, nemzetközi recepciós hatások* [Training of Pedagogues and their Professional Knowlede in Hungary I. 1775-1945. National Trends of Development and Reception of International Tendencies] (Budapest: ELTE Eötvös Kiadó, 2012); Béla Pukánszky, «A tanárképző intézet szerepének alakulása a magyarországi tanárképzés történetében» [The Role of the Teacher Training Institute in the History of the Hungarian Teacher Training], *Pedagógusképzés* 39-40 (2013): 73-91.

teachers and the changes within this process between 1918-1919 will be discussed. In the rest of the paper, two-two cases related to the investigated institutions will be shown from the period of the early 1920s which suggest that the state intrusion into the inner affairs of professional organisations continued after the fall of the ephemerally existing communist regime in 1919.

Developments in secondary teacher training in Hungary in the early 1920s also had international relevance. This aspect could be grasped by the singularity of the Hungarian developments compared to the other countries belonging to the Central and Eastern European region. As a consequence of the war, governments took the initiative in almost all countries of that part of Europe (Germany,<sup>4</sup> Austria,<sup>5</sup> Czechoslovakia,<sup>6</sup> Romania,7 the Serbian-Croatian and Slovenian Kingdom8) to either transform the school systems inherited from the previous political era or create a new education structure that could unify the newly emerged states. Nevertheless, the initiatives of the Hungarian government aimed at preserving the inherited structures from the period of the Austro-Hungarian Monarchy but in a form that could be aligned with the new ideology of the Horthy-regime.9 The transformation of the personal background of the professional institutions and the harmonization of their inner operation with the expectation of the government led to their gradual deprofessionalization.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Uwe Sandfuchs, «Die Lehrerbildung in Deutschland - Geschichte, Struktur und Reform», in *Lehrerbildung in Europa. Geschichte, Struktur und Reform*, eds. András Németh and Ehrenhard Skiera (Frankfurt am Main - New York: Peter Lang, 2012), 59-72.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Gerald Grimm, Beáta Bali and Veronika Pirka, «Leherbildung in Österreich - Aspekte ihrer Genese von den Anfängen im späten 18. Jahrhundert bis zur Zweiten Republik», in *Lehrerbildung in Europa. Geschichte, Struktur und Reform,* eds. András Németh and Ehrenhard Skiera (Frankfurt am Main - New York: Peter Lang, 2012), 91-110.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Tomaš Kasper and Dana Kasperová, «Lehrerbildung in der Tsechischen Republik - historische und aktuelle Aspekte», in eds. András Németh and Ehrenhard Skiera *Lehrerbildung in Europa*. *Geschichte, Struktur und Reform* (Frankfurt am Main - New York: Peter Lang, 2012), 219-239.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Emilia Gogu, Corina-Cristina Bozdugan and Daniela Nenciu, «Profile of the Romanian Upper Schooling During the Interwar Period», *Fiat Iustitia* 12 (2) (2018): 82-95, https://ideas.repec.org/a/dcu/journl/v12y2018i2p81-95.html; Irina Livezeneau, *Cultural politics in Greater Romania. Regionalism, nation building & ethnic struggle, 1918-1930* (Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 2000), 34-36.

Edvard Protner, Zdenko Medves, Stefka Batinic et al., «The Development of Teacher Training in the Stats of Former Yugoslavia», in Lehrerbildung in Europa. Geschichte, Struktur und Reform, eds. András Németh and Ehrenhard Skiera (Frankfurt am Main - New York: Peter Lang, 2012), 237-265.

<sup>9</sup> In Hungary, the period between 1920 and 1944 named after the governer of Miklós Horthy.

#### THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

In an essay by Talcott Parsons, professionalization was labelled as the main indicator of modernization in western societies. <sup>10</sup> Researchers who followed the principles determined by Parsons investigated the corporations of professional groups and the traits of these organisations mainly based on the self-definition of the professionals. By accepting the self-perception of professional groups, several aspects of the nature between the professionals and the rest of the society in which they performed remained veiled. In the 1970s, several researchers suggested that the trait model of the research completely missed revealing the role of power, by which professional groups monopolized their special field of interest. <sup>11</sup>

Additionally, Hans Albrecht Hesse pointed out in his volume that state power played a pivotal role in organising the modern professions in the Central-European context to modernize the social structures. <sup>12</sup> Following the path set by Hesse, researchers of the critical approach of professional theories examined the training system of the professionals with special attention to the universities and higher education-attached training programs since special competencies were transferred to professional candidates in these programs, which made them specialists with distinct social functions. Universities and professors began to exercise a certain control over disciplines, in which theoretical knowledge and professional competencies were encompassed. University professors took control over the distribution and formation processes of the theoretical knowledge of professions leading to the detachment of the professional training programs from the market economy processes. Thus, professors who represented the elites of the professions were able to monopolize the formation and operation of professional groups through state contribution and recognition.<sup>13</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> Talcott Parsons, «The professions and social structure», in *Essays in sociological theory*, ed. Talcott Parsons (London: Macmillan, 1955), 37.

Terence Johnson, *Professions and power* (London - New York: MacMillan, 1972), 25-28; Magali Sarfatti Larson, *The rise of professionalism. A sociological analysis* (Berkely: University of California Press, 1977).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> Hans Albrecht Hesse, Berufe im Wandel: ein Beitrag zum Problem der Professionalisierung (Stuttgart: Eke, 1968), 28-35.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Elliot Friedson, *Professionalism. The third logic* (Cambridge: Polity Press, 2001), 87-92; Peter Lundgreen, «Berufskonstruktion und Professionalisierung in historische Perspektive», in *Professionalisierung pädagogischen Berufe im historischen Prozeβ*, eds. Hans Jürgen Apel, Klaus-Peter Horn, Peter Lundgreen and Uwe Sandfuchs (Bad Heilbrunn: Verlag Julius Klinkhadt, 1999), 21-22; Konrad H.

This aforementioned phenomenon was labelled by Charles McClelland as a "back door control" referring to the enormous power and multiple roles of professors who not only did control and disseminate the theoretical knowledge necessary for exercising a profession but also performed as leaders in professional organizations and even at the level of decision making in the governmental structures as members of advisory boards. <sup>14</sup> The presence of professionals in the sphere of politics cannot be regarded as an anomaly due to the fact that state control was realized partly through the regulations of professional training. <sup>15</sup>

Moreover, even Parsons believed that professional groups and the state administration are mutually dependent on each other and there is a fine balance between them. 16 If this balance was tipped in favour of the state administration for some reason, the operation of the professional groups would be hindered. The hindrance is classified as a deprofessionalization process, which refers to the fact that the social circumstances fundamentally changed in the twentieth century in comparison with the period the professions emerged. This change could result in 1) the loss of the privileged social status of professionals, 2) losing control over their training and 3) the total transformation of the ideology of the professions, which served as a primary drive for monopolizing their professional activities. 4) As a result of the deprofessionalization, professional organizations were disbanded or transformed in a way that leadership was given to those collaborators who proved to be loval servants of the state power. 5) In extreme cases, the validity of the permission of professionals to perform in the labour market was suspended temporarily or permanently.<sup>17</sup>

Deprofessionalization is a rare historical phenomenon, however, it could be perceived in Nazi Germany and the USSR where some of the

Jarausch, The unfree professions. German lawyers, teachers and engineers, 1800-1950 (New York - Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990), 16-23.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> Charles E. McClelland, *The German experience of professionalization. Modern learned professions and their organizations from the early nineteenth century to the Hitler era* (Cambridge - New York - Sydney: Cambridge University Press, 1991, 25.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> Martin Heidenreich, «Berufskonstruktion und Professionalisierung. Erträgen soziologischen Forschung», in Apel, *Professionalisierung pädagogischen Berufe*, 35-40.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> Parsons, «The professions and social structure", 47-48; Julia Evetts, «The sociological analysis of professionalism. Occupational change in the modern world». *International Sociology* 2 (2003): 400.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>17</sup> Friedson, *Professionalism*, 128-129.

professions were deprofessionalized thanks to the intrusion of the state into the personal and theoretical dimensions of the professions. Deprofessionalizing professions was not in the interest even of these totalitarian regimes since the disappearance of the specialists could have undermined the functionality of the societies. Nevertheless, operating in unfavourable political and social circumstances could also lead to achieving the state of deprofessionalization, which reveals an important feature of this socio-historical phenomenon, namely its extended process character. Deprofessionalization is considered to the intrusion of the state of the specialists could have undermined the functionality of the societies.

Even though the immediate aftermath of the war left circumstances that strengthened the unfavourable conditions for the operation of professional groups, professions did not begin to be deprofessionalized immediately in countries of the Central and Eastern European region. In Germany and Austria, the professionals related to secondary teacher training recognized the necessity of cooperating with the new political regimes despite their conservative attitude. Still, professional institutions managed to preserve a certain distance from the executive branch of the state until the Nazis occupied all segments of society. Similarly to Hungary, Christian-conservatives were in charge of education affairs in Austria in the 1920s. Despite the structural reforms implemented in teacher training, professional institutions remained intact from state interventions, which cannot be claimed in the case of Hungary. Moreover, the reform initiatives of the Austrian education ministry were elaborated by Richard Meistner a pedagogy professor at the University of Vienna.

Furthermore, other countries of the region, i.e. Czechoslovakia, Romania and the Serbian-Croatian and Slovenian Kingdom also implemented structural reforms in their teacher training and even withdrew the license of some professionals to practice. The ultimate aim of these reform initiatives was to unify the newly emerged countries through education since these states emerged as the consequence of the Parisian Peace Treaties (1919-1920) and were compounded by several territories with different

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>18</sup> McClelland, *The German experience*, 223-227., Jarausch, *The unfree professions*, 8., Friedson, *Professionalism*, 140-141.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>19</sup> Friedson, *Professionalism*, 129.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>20</sup> Jarausch, The unfree professions, 31-39.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>21</sup> McClelland, The German experience, 177-179.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>22</sup> Grimm, Bali and Pirka, «Leherbildung in Österreich", 99.

ethnic, economic and institutional backgrounds. Initial state interventions inflicted politically inspired interrogations on the remnants of old professionals as happened in the case of the University of Pressburg in Czechoslovakia<sup>23</sup> and the University of Klausenburg<sup>24</sup> in Romania in 1919-1920. After professionals of the previous political system were dismissed and their offices were taken by individuals loyal to the new governments, reforms were implemented to solidify social circumstances and thus ensure the territorial gains of the new countries. These state interventions were motivated by ethnic tensions since the excluded professionals were representatives of the old elites of the Austro-Hungarian Monarchy. Thus, these types of state intrusions in the internal affairs of professional institutions can be interpreted as the demolition of old structures and new professionalization initiatives of the newly emerged states.

The Hungarian case, however, differed from the countries of the region since the state interventions did not aim to modify the institutional settings in the teacher training before 1924 and it was not motivated either by abolishing all the previously emerged institutional elements and creating an entirely new institutional structure with new professionals. The Hungarian Christian-socialists wanted to align the professional institutions with the clerical-conservative ideology of the government to ensure the political stability of the country and adapt society to the new realities resulting from the disastrous consequences of the war. Nevertheless, these adaption processes led to steady depforessionalization due to the recurring state interventions in different forms, from which two-two cases will be detailed from the early period of the 1920s.

## THE METHOD OF THE INVESTIGATION AND THE SOURCES

The research in the focus of this paper can be characterized as deductive and idiographic research. It is deductive since the research problem is derived from the professional theories, by which historical notions related

 $<sup>^{23}</sup>$  Ignác Romsics, Magyarország története a XX. században [The History of Hungary in the 20th century] (Budapest: Osiris Kiadó, 2004), 182-183.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>24</sup> Livezeneau, Cultural politics, 219-224.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>25</sup> Péter Tibor Nagy, «Az állami befolyás növekedése a magyarországi oktatásban (1867-1945)» [The Increase of the State Influence on the Education in Hungary (1867-1945)] (Academic Doctoral Thesis, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, 2003), 155-157.

to the secondary teacher training will be interpreted. Furthermore, it is also idiographic due to the scale of the involved primary sources and the intention to take into account all elements that had a role in the development of the secondary teacher profession.<sup>26</sup> Document analysis of the archival sources and secondary literature review were employed as primary methods.<sup>27</sup> The data gathered from the usage of the method were synthesised dialectically to be able to depict both the inner circumstances of the investigated institutions involved in the research and their impact on the whole secondary teaching profession. 28 Additionally, research questions also try to reflect on the intention to reveal both the inner structures of the professional institutions and the character of the structure, which came into existence as a result of their operation. Three main research questions are to be answered during the research. First and foremost, revealing the operation mechanisms of the Secondary Teacher Examination Committee and the Secondary Teacher Training Institute. Secondly, determining the connections between the institutions involved in secondary teacher training. This aspect includes not only the previously mentioned institutions but other elements of the institutional environment, for instance, the faculty of philosophy and the Baron Eötvös József College. Lastly, the third research question focuses on the investigation of the connections between the Ministry of Religion and Public Education (MRPE) as a governmental entity responsible for the regulation of teacher training and the professional institutions in the capital and other Hungarian full universities (Debrecen, Szeged, Pécs).<sup>29</sup> Throughout the rest of the paper, this latter research aspect

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>26</sup> Earl Babbie, *A társadalomtudományi kutatás gyakorlata* [The Practice of Social Research] (Budapest: Balassi Kiadó, 2008), 82.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>27</sup> Károly Veress, *Bevezetés a hermeneutikába* [Introduction to Hermeneutics] (Budapest: L'Harmattan - Magyar Daseinanalitikai Egyesület, 2019), 104-109; Emilio Betti, «A hermeneutika mint a szellemtudományok általános módszertana» [Hermeneutics as a general method of history of ideals], *Athenaeum* 1, no. 2 (1992): 16-19; Carla Willing, «Interpretation and analysis», in *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Data Analysis*, ed. Uwe Flick (London - Washington: Sage, 2014), 138.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>28</sup> Katalin Kéri, *Bevezetés a neveléstörténeti kutatások módszertanába* [Introduction to Methodology of Research Activities in the Discipline of History of Education] (Budapest: Műszaki Könyvkiadó, 2001), 73.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>29</sup> Full universities are meant as higher education institutions at least entailing four faculties, namely philosophy, medicine, law, and theology. This criterion could be applied to the higher education institutions mentioned in the text. It also seems necessary outlining that before 1918 only three full universities existed in Hungary. The first was established in Tyrnau (Nagyszombat) but moved to Pest in the late eighteenth century. In 1872, another university was established in Klausenburg (Kolozsvár), which later moved to Szeged as the result of the Great War. In the last period of the Austro-Hungarian Monarchy, two additional universities were set up in Debrecen and Preßburg (Pozsony) in 1912. The

will be discussed in details focusing on the connections between the MRPE and the professional institutions of the capital by depicting two cases highlighting the transformation of the connections between the state entities and the professional organizations after 1918.

The focus is narrowed to one research question out of the three for the following reasons. First of all, this is an ongoing research in the phase of revealing and processing the relevant sources, by which the history of secondary teacher training could be depicted. Therefore, this study could be characterized as a "preliminary report" of the whole research process.

Secondly, the emphasis is also set on the initial phase of the endeavours of the MRPE to restrict the independent operations mechanisms of the professional institutions to outline the change in the connections between the professionals and the state bureaucracy after the Great War. By focusing on this aspect, it could be highlighted that there was a continuity of blatant attempts of state intrusions into the internal affairs of professional institutions between different regimes after 1918. From that perspective, the Horthy-era did not differ significantly from its predecessors between 1918-1919 since it also attempted to alter the personnel composition and the principles which determined the operation of professional institutions. These historical phenomena could be characterised as deprofessionalization tendencies that professional institutions had to face on a recurring basis throughout the whole of the interwar period.

All research questions, including the one which stands in the focal point of the current paper, are examined in the archival sources available in the National Archives of Hungary (NAH). Primary sources available here are connected primarily to the third research aspect, namely the connections between MRPE and the professional institutions.<sup>30</sup> Furthermore, sources

latter institution moved to Budapest and then to Pécs after 1920. Even though in different time periods, but teacher examination committees and teacher training institutions were assigned to all the full universities. See Németh, *Magyar pedagógusképzés*, 89-103.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>30</sup> Within the NHA materials connected to the history of teacher training institutions, the sources could be found in sections of K592 and K636 were involved in the research, which contains archival sources of the 5th department (secondary schools between 1919 and 1944) and the 4th department (universities and colleges between 1919 and 1944) of the MRPE, respectively. Although both the Secondary Teacher Examination Committee and the Secondary Teacher Training Institution were higher education institutions, their affairs were relegated to the Department of Secondary Schools for ideological reasons in 1919 and remained there until 1923.

available in the Archives of Eötvös Loránd University (AELU) are also involved in the investigation. These materials are concerned with the inner operation mechanisms of the teacher examination committee and the teacher training institution. Moreover, some aspects related to the connection between the MRPE and other professional entities also could be revealed.<sup>31</sup> Archives of the Eötvös College (Mednyánszky Dénes Library and Archives, referred to as MDLA in later parts of the paper) are also involved in the research since both the relationship between professional institutions and some aspects of the inner operation of the teacher training institution could be examined in the documents preserved here.<sup>32</sup>

## INSTITUTIONAL DEVELOPMENT OF THE SECONDARY TEACHER TRAINING IN HUNGARY UNTIL 1918

Until 1849-1850, the philosophy faculty of the University of Pest had been subjected to the other faculties, which provided preparatory training for students aiming at continuing their studies in upper faculties. After the fall of the revolution in 1848/1849, the Habsburgian government implemented higher education reforms following the idea of the reforms in Berlin carried out half a century earlier in 1809 to set a new course to the battered empire.<sup>33</sup> As a result, the faculty trained intellectuals ready for teaching in the newly created 8-grade secondary schools. However, the teacher qualification state exam cannot be completed in Hungary until 1862 since the lack of a Secondary Teaching Examination Committee.<sup>34</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>31</sup> The primary concern of the investigation is to process and analyse sources in fonds of 14/e («Documents of the Directorate of the Secondary Teacher Examination committee between 1866 and 1949») and the 15/b («Documents of the Administration of the Secondary Teacher Training Institution between 1871 and 1949») in Archives of Eötvös Loránd University (AELU).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>32</sup> The archival materials related to the external connections of the College are preserved in the section of «Documents related to the education and directorate affairs of the institution, 1895-1945», 50 Box, 95/1-4 dossier. MDLA., the section of the «Connections between MRPE and the directorate of the Eötvös College», 50 Box, 96/b/1-3 dossier, MDLA.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>33</sup> Rebekka Horlacher, *The educated subject and the German concept of Bildung. A Cultural History* (New York - London: Routledge, 2016), 58-62; Németh, *Magyar pedagógusképzés*, 51-53.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>34</sup> Previously committees were established in other parts of the Habsburg Empire in Vienna, Lemberg, Innsbruck and Prague after the introduction of the first provisional teacher training law in 1853. Garai Imre, *A középiskolai tanári professzió intézményesülésének folyamatai. A tanárvizsgáló bizottság és a tanárképzö intézet möködése a pesti tudományegyetemen az 1862-1919 közötti idöszakban* [Professionalization Processes of the Secondary School Teacher Profession. Operation of the Secondary Teacher Examination Committee and the Teacher Training Institue of the University of Pest, 1862-1919] (Budapest: ELTE Eötvös College, 2022), 49.

Besides the lack of a teacher examination board, the training of secondary teachers was hindered by the fact that the training of the philosophy faculty was unsystematic due to the constant change in the curriculum, which can be seen as a structural deficiency of the universities following the Humboldtian ideal.<sup>35</sup> To mitigate this issue, curricular reforms were introduced in 1875, 1882 and 1888, which inserted comprehensive exams in all training programs to systemize the training and ensure the preparation of the candidates for the state examination.<sup>36</sup>

Additionally, new institutions were set up to ensure the teacher candidates' theoretical and practical preparedness after the Compromise in 1867.37 Basically, the development of teacher training in Hungary can be perceived as several attempts to systemize the training without the intrusion of the structure of the philosophy faculty. Avoiding direct political intrusion into the inner affairs of the faculty was a priority for all MRPE ministers. In 1870, the Hungarian Royal Secondary Teacher Training Institute of Budapest was established, which could be regarded as a conglomerate of seminars under a common administration. In the first period of the operation of the institute, methodological preparation dominated the training following the model of the Hevne and Wolf types of classical-philologist courses. Later, the methodological training was replaced by theoretical training thanks to the full professors of the philosophy faculty who influenced the training of the institution.<sup>38</sup> Consequently, a Practicing Secondary School of the Teacher Training Institute was founded in 1872, which was regarded as a true Hungarian investment by the contemporaries

Pukánszky, «A tanárképző intézet szerepének», 78-79.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>36</sup> Garai, A középiskolai tanári professzió, 284-285.

elite, which transformed the Habsburgian Empire into the Austro-Hungarian Monarchy. After the fall of the Hungarian revolution in 1849, the Habsburgs oppressed Hungary and reintroduced the absolutistic way of governance. Due to the serious military collapses in Italy in 1859-1861 and against Prussia in 1866, the oppression could not be maintened that forced Franz Jopesh I. to begin negotions with the Hungarians. In 1867, the Compromise ensured the maintainance of the Habsburgian Empire but in a transformed way. Austria and Hungary formed a "real union", which meant to have common affairs derived from the fact that both countries had a common ruler. The common affairs were the foreign affairs, military affairs and finances covering the financial backgrounds of both the foreign and the military related expenses. From other aspects, both parts of the Monarchy was governed by their governments independently. Romsics, *Magyarország története*, 17.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>38</sup> Michael J. Hofstetter, *The romantic idea of a university*. *England and Germany, 1770-1850* (New York: Palgrave, 2001), 20-25.

despite the German origins of practical training. By establishing a practical school, the theoretical and the practical preparation of the profession were separated from each other.<sup>39</sup>

In 1887, the faculty council of the philosophy faculty decided to establish seminars for rationalising its training, but this initiative did not prove to be fruitful, since the preparation for the necessary exams for teacher candidates remained unfulfilled. Over some time, theoretical training and scientific-research-related activities dominated these courses. Therefore, The Eötvös József College as a teacher training boarding school was founded in 1895, which followed the institutional example of the Parisian École Normale Supérieure. The MRPE expected the institution to be as effective as its French counterpart.<sup>40</sup>

Moreover, the foundation coincided with the crystallization of the ideology of teacher training, which manifested in the "scholar-teacher" concept. It partly refers to the Humboldtian origins of the training, namely the teaching activities had to be based on meticulous scientific training and thus well-prepared scholar-teachers could lead a slow social reform through propagating self-cultivation. Partly, it is connected to the idea of the social mission of the French secondary teachers, which was to disseminate the cultural achievements of the country while remaining loyal servants of the state.<sup>41</sup> This element was of utmost importance in Hungary with its multiethnic social reality.

Despite the complex institutional system, only 17.6% of teacher candidates were given systematic training in one of the institutions in the academic year of 1917/1918. It was not a surprise that the legal changes in the revolutionary period between 1918-1919 aimed at systematizing

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>39</sup> Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 100-103, Pukánszky, «A tanárképzö intézet szerepének", 81-83.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>40</sup> Even in the 1920s, the leaders of the Eötvös College referred to the institutional example of the French École Normale when they wished to justify the appointment of a vice-principal in the institution. Teleki Pál, «205/1922. - 5. Cur. sz. Felterjesztés a Vallás és Közoktatásügyi Minisztériumhoz (VKM) az Eötvös Collegiumba aligazgató kinevezése tárgyában» [Proposal of Pál Teleki, the president of the Eötvös College to appoint a vice-director in the Eötvös College]. Budapest, 1922, 50 Box, 95/3 Dossier, MDAL. (Both of the abbreviations of VKM and MRPE stands for Ministry of Religion and Public Education. The VKM format is used when it is referred in Hungarian and the MRPE could be considered its English version).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>41</sup> Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 42-46., Raymond Bourdoncle and Andre Robert, «Primary and secondary school teachers in France: changes in identities and professionalization», *Journal of Education Policy* 15 (2000): 70-73.

the training by extending the training of the teacher training institution to all teacher candidates.<sup>42</sup>

## A SUMMARY OF THE CHANGES IN TEACHER TRAINING DURING THE COMMUNIST REGIME IN 1919

According to Pál Hatos, the Great War had disastrous consequences on the Hungarian society. The war paralyzed and dissolved the functionality of society due to the subordination of all economic and social efforts to win the war.<sup>43</sup> This had a consequence on the universities including the teacher training, which basically led to the deterioration of the theoretical and practical training of the candidates. In the first phase of the war, only a minor reduction in preparation time for state exams was given to veterans returning from the trenches. From 1918, veterans who had been spending 7 semesters or more time on active duty were allowed to apply for the comprehensive exam and after its completion, they could apply for the state exam immediately without any further theoretical preparation.<sup>44</sup> Furthermore, the one-year-long practical training was reduced to three months before the last phase of the state exam.<sup>45</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>42</sup> Garai, A középiskolai tanári professzió, 272.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>43</sup> Hatos Pál, *Az elátkozott köztársaság. Az 1918-as összeomlás és az öszirózsás forradalom története* [The Sick Republic. The History of the Collapse in 1918 and the Democratic Revolution] (Budapest: Jaffa Kiadó, 2018), 22.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>44</sup> Lovászy, Márton, «A vallás- és közoktatásügyi magyar miniszter 1918. évi 95.975. számú rendelete az összes főiskolákhoz, a háborúból visszatért tanulóknak tanulmányi idejükben szenvedett veszteségeikért való kárpótlásáról» [No. 95.975 decree of Lovászy Márton MRPE to all higher education institutions in 1918 about the compensation of university students for their time loss due to have been in active service on the frontlines], Budapest, 21st November 1918, II-III. Fund 14/e, 2 Box, 2 dossier, AELU. See Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 254-255.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>45</sup> After completing the 4-year-long theoretical training at the university, secondary teacher candidates were expected to complete a 1-year-long practical training in a public secondary school. Pedagogical training could have begun and completed after passing the last theoretical comprehensive exam in order to ensure the candidates' theoretical preparedness before commencing the teaching practice. The decree issued by Lovászy MRPE completely crushed this idea by reducing the length of the training to 3 months and made it possible to begin teaching activities during the theoretical training. Lovászy, Márton, «A vallás- és közoktatásügyi magyar miniszter 1918. évi 95.975. számú rendelete az összes főiskolákhoz, a háborúból visszatért tanulóknak tanulmányi idejükben szenvedett veszteségeikért való kárpótlásáról» [No. 95.975 decree of Lovászy Márton MRPE to all higher education institutions in 1918 about the compensation of university students for their time loss due to have been in active service on the frontlines], Budapest, 21st November 1918, VI. Fund 14/e, 2 Box, 2 dossier, AELU. See Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 254-255.

After the communist regime had come to power on 21st of March 1919, several changes were made affecting teacher training. These changes can be categorized into three groups. The first is related to personal changes in the teaching boards in all training institutions. Several changes were made at the personal level both at the philosophy faculty and in the Secondary Teacher Examination Committee which had a close connection with the faculty since full professors were entrusted to give exams. The scale of the changes can be understood through the composition of the committee. Only 15 examiners remained in place out of the 68 members of the newly appointed committee.<sup>46</sup> The second level of the changes affects the training at the theoretical level. The communist politicians believed that the "scholar-teacher" concept should be abolished. and "socially sensitive teachers" should be trained instead. Consequently, sociology, economics, socio-psychology and socio-biology were added to the general level of the training of the candidates, which can be interpreted as an outright intrusion into the theoretical level of the training.<sup>47</sup> On the third level, the whole structure of the training transformed. All previously established institutions were centralized under the direction of the teacher training institution, which was renamed Secondary Teacher Training College.<sup>48</sup> Moreover, the structure of the examinations was also

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>46</sup> Közoktatásügyi Népbiztosság [Public Education Commissariat], «75029/1919. IV. Dr. Wittmann Ferenc a budapesti középiskolai tanárvizsgáló bizottság alelnökének állás alóli felmentése tárgyában» [Dismissal of Dr. Ferenc Wittmann, the vice-president of the Secondary Teacher Examination Committee], Budapest, 8<sup>th</sup> April 1918, K 592 Fund, 31 Bunch, 25 Title (1919), NAH., MRPE, «81.537/1919. VI-1. A budapesti középiskolai tanárvizsgáló bizottság új elnökének ügyvezető alelnökének és tagjainak kinevezése tárgyában» [Appointing the new president and members of the Secondary Teacher Examination Committee in Budapest], Budapest, 30<sup>th</sup> April 1919, K 592 Fund, 31 Bunch, 25 Title (1919), NAH. See also Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 425-428.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>47</sup> A Közoktatásügyi Népbizottság, «172701/1919. szám alatt Tóth Lajos javaslatát véleményezésre leküldte, amely alapján szociális biológiai és szociális pszichológiai tanszék megszervezésére tett javaslatot» [The Public Education Commissariate send the proposal of Lajos Tóth under the No. 172701/1919, by which social biology and socio psychology departments are advised to be established], Budapest, 23rd July 1919, 15/b 4 Fund, Napló [Registry of the Teacher Training Institution], 1906-1921, AELU.

Lukács György népbiztos helyettes, «159.085 VI/. 1. Rendelet az Eötvös Collegium Középiskolai Tanítóképzö Föiskolába történö beolvasztása tárgyában» [Decree of György Lukács vice-commissar of public education in merging Eötvös College into the Secondary Teacher Training College], Budapest, 14th July, 1919, 50 Box, 96/b/3 dossier, MDLA. (Imre Garai, An elite teacher training institute. The history of Eötvös József Collegium, 1895-1950 (Budapest: ELTE Eötvös College, 2019), 160. Additionally, a "Curative Pedagogical Secondary School" was also attached to the new Teacher Training College. The regulation of the secondary school was preserved among the archival materials of the transformed teacher training institution. See: Dr. Ranschburg Pál, «95.895/1919. B. VIII. Jelentés a Középiskolai Tanítóképzö Föiskola gyógyító pedagógiai gyakorló középiskolájának szervezeti szabályzatáról» [Report of Dr Pál Ranschburg about the regulation of the Curative Secondary Pedgogical School of the

altered significantly. The written parts of the state exam were erased including the necessity of writing and defending a thesis. Similarly, the pedagogical exam, which had been a compulsory part of the state exam since 1882 was also driven out.<sup>49</sup>

## CONTINUITY AND DISCONTINUITY IN THE OPERATION OF THE PROFESSIONAL INSTITUTIONS OF THE SECONDARY SCHOOL TEACHER TRAINING

## **Intrusion into the personal and curricular affairs of the Secondary Teacher Training Institution**

After the communist regime was toppled on 1st August 1919, all legal changes issued after 31st October 1918 were annulled. Following the restoration of the teacher training institution, its director, Gedeon Petz50 believed the institution could continue the operation as it was before the war. In early September 1919, the rehabilitated director reported on the latest developments of the members of the council of the teacher training institution since the preliminary step of renewing the institution was the appointment of new members to vacant positions and the rehabilitation of those who were alive since the council was the most important organisation of the institution.51

Secondary Teacher Training College]. Budapest, 21<sup>st</sup> May, 1919, K 592 Fund, 31 Bunch, 25 Title (1919), NAH. Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 270.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>49</sup> Közoktatásügyi Népbiztosság [Public Education Commissariat], «79.686/1919. VI-1. A középiskolai tanárvizsgálati szabályzat módosítása tárgyában» [Modification of the exam regulations of the secondary teacher candidates], Budapest, 4<sup>th</sup> April 1919, K 592 Fund, 31 Bunch, 25 Title (1919), NAH. Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 258-259.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>50</sup> Petz was a professor of German language and literature and appointed as director of the teacher training institution in 1905 when the previous director stepped down for personal reasons Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 243.

The establishment of the council was the result of a structural reform issued by Loránd Eötvös in 1899. Eötvös as a full professor of physics had a particular interest in teacher training and intended to systematize the operation of the teacher training institution by setting up a permanent board. The council consisted of the president of the council, the director of the institution, the vice-director and 7 more council members. The president had a representative role and usually did not take part in the daily operation of the institution. These tasks were performed by the director and the vice-director. The responsibility of the council was to determine the educational programme of the institution in each semester and scrutinize the education advancement of those teacher candidates who chose to be a member of the institute, which was not mandatory until 1924. See MRPE, «38.640/1899. A budapesti m. kir. középiskolai tanárképző-intézet Szervezeti Szabályzata» [Organisational Regulation of the Hungarian Royal Secondary Teacher Training Instution], Budapest, 1899. 15/d Fund, 13 Box, AELU.

Petz reported that the 108.157/1914 MRPE degree on 22<sup>nd</sup> August 1914 appointed the members of the council before the war. From those who regained their positions back then, the president, Loránd Eötvös passed away, one council member retired and his position remained vacant and another member collaborated with the communist regime, which prevented him from fulfilling his duties.

Concerning the presidency, Petz suggested that apart from himself as the de-facto head of the institution, two other senior members should be appointed to the position. One was Izidor Fröhlich who was also a full professor of physics as was the deceased former president. Fröhlich had been teaching in the institution for almost 40 years by 1919, which made him one of the most senior members.<sup>52</sup> The other appointed professor was Zsolt Beöthy, whose career almost began simultaneously with the presence of Fröhlich in the institute. Compared to Fröhlich, the prestige of Beöthy was higher since he was promoted as the president of both the teacher examination committee and the teacher training institution from 1890 until 1896 when he stepped down from the position of the latter institute.<sup>53</sup> Lastly, Petz also implied in his report the possibility of postponing the appointment until the general situation in the country became more stable.<sup>54</sup>

The MRPE decided to leave the presidency vacant and appointed the members of the council for only one academic year instead of the previously standard 5-year term.<sup>55</sup> On the 9th of October 1920, the ministry issued the decree of 110.614/920. V. containing the 5-year length appointment of the director, the council members and the president.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>52</sup> Garai, A középiskolai tanári professzió, 178.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>53</sup> Istvánné Kiss, *Szemelvények a budapesti egyetemi tanárképző intézet gyakorlógimnáziumának jegyzőkönyveiből (1924-1944)* [Extrats from the Minutes of the Secondary Practicing School of the Teacher Training Institute of the University of Pest (1924-1944)] (Budapest: Országos Pedagógiai Könyvtár és Múzeum, 1991), 6-7.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>54</sup> Petz Gedeon igazgató, «Jelentés a tanárképző intézet tanácsának tagjairól» [Report of Gedeon Petz the director of the teacher training instutiton about the member of the council], Budapest, September 1919. K 592 Fund, 31 Bunch, 25 Title (1919), NAH.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>55</sup> VKM, «183.959/919 BXVI. sz. A tanárképző intézet igazgatójának és a tanács tagjainak a kinevezése az 1919/1920. tanév időtartamára» [The MRPE appointed the director and the members of the council of the Secondary Teacher Training Institution for the academic term of 1919/1920], Budapest, 20th September 1919, 15/b 4 Fund, Napló [Registry of the Teacher Training Institution], 1906-1921, AELU.

Regarding the leadership of the institution, Remig Békefi was awarded by the trust of the ministry. 56 His choice was unusual from multiple perspectives. First, courses held by him in the teacher training institute appeared in the syllabus more than a decade later compared to the first appearance of Fröhlich and Beöthy. Additionally, he gained his full professorship only in 1900 thanks to his volumes on the history of education in Hungary in the early modern times.<sup>57</sup> Secondly, he was nominated as a member of the council in 1911 for a short period but he stepped down the next year due to his election as the abbot of Zirc.58 As a result of his new role, his presence in the teacher training institution became rare and he could hardly manage to even hold his lectures. Lastly, he was a cleric whose presence was not unusual in the institution, however, their number decreased steadily with the progress of secularization and Békefi remained the only individual who represented them in the institution in the first decade of the twentieth century.<sup>59</sup> In fact, he became the first clerical who occupied the top position of the teacher training institution.

His nomination could be perceived as a clear political intention of paving the way for a new area, in which a new clerical-conservative ideology dominated education after the fall of the communist regime. Secularization and the separation of the state and ecclesiastic affairs particularly in the field of education, which stood at the core of the education policy of the Dualist era cannot be interpreted anymore after the revolutions and the fall of the Monarchy. Thus, the appointment of

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>56</sup> VKM, «110.614/920. V. sz. A tanárképző intézet elnökének, igazgatójának és a tanács tagjainak a kinevezése az 1920/1921 évtől az 1925/1926. évig szóló időtartamra» [The MRPE nominted the president, the director and the members of the council for the term of 1920/1921 and 1925/1926 academic years], Budapest, 9th October 1920, 15/b 4 Fund, Napló [Registry of the Teacher Training Institution], 1906-1921, AELU.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>57</sup> Imre Szentpétery, *A királyi magyar Pázmány Péter Tudományegyetem története. Vol. 4. A bölcsészettudományi kar története, 1635-1935* [The History of the Royal Hungarian Péter Pázmány University. Vol. 4. The History of the Philosophy Faculty, 1635-1935] (Budapest: Királyi Magyar Egyetemi Nyomda. 1935), 582.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>58</sup> Zirc is located approximately 120 kilometres westwards from Budapest. The abbey was founded here in the late twelfth century and maintained by the Cistercian order. It has a significant cultural importance due to the education-related activities of the order. In later centuries, several Gymnasiums were founded or maintained by the Cistercians and consequently governed from Zirc as the Hungarian centre for the order.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>59</sup> Garai, A középiskolai tanári professzió, 246.

Békefi could be regarded not as just a sign of a major political shift but also as an era for the professional institutions, in which their interest derived from their unique social function and expertise could be overruled at any time for ideological reasons.<sup>60</sup>

Not only did the MRPE intrude into personal affairs but also tried to influence the theoretical training of the institution. In late November 1919, the MRPE issued a request to consider the possibility of introducing compulsory philosophy and economics courses for all teacher candidates and make the visitation of these courses the prerequisite of applying for state examinations from 1919/1920.61 This request was an extraordinary development from at least two aspects. First, it had never occurred before the war in the history of the institution that a governmental entity put forward a request concerning the theoretical part of the training. The communist regime was the first, which tried to establish the foundations of political indoctrination.62 Secondly, just after the fall of the communist regime in an atmosphere of revenge and tensions,63 considering a request of such political sensitivity could have resulted in bitter consequences for the whole of the institution.

Therefore, the council delegated the case to Ernő Fináczy for examining the request of the ministry.<sup>64</sup> Although Fináczy was a full professor of

Nagy, «Az állami befolyás növekedése », 15-16.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>61</sup> VKM, «200.884/919. BXVI. sz. Leirat a társadalomtudományi és közgazdasági kurzusok kötelezővé tételéről a tanárjelöltek számára az 1919/1920. tanévtől» [Decree of the MRPE about compulsory sociological and economic classes for all teacher candidates from the academic year of 1919/1920], Budapest, 21st November 1919, K 592 Fund, 31 Bunch, 25 Title (1919), NAH.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>62</sup> Balassa József a középiskolai tanítóképző főiskola igazgatója, «275/1918-1919. Felterjesztés a Középiskolai Tanítóképző Főiskola szervezeti szabályzatáról» [József Balassa the head of the Secondary Teacher Training College submission on the organisational regulation of the College], Budapest, 16th July 1919, K 592 Fund, 31 Bunch, 25 Title (1919), NAH.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>63</sup> The investigation of those teachers who remained in position during the communist period had just begun in October 1919 and lasted until April 1920. See Petz Gedeon a középiskolai tanárképző intézet igazgatója, «177/1920. Levél a VKM-miniszterhez az igazoló eljárásokról» [Gedeon Petz the director of the teacher training institution informs the ministry about the results of the interrogation processes], Budapest, 23<sup>rd</sup> April 1920, K 592 Fund, 143 Bunch, 19 Title (1920), NAH.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>64</sup> A Tanárképző Intézet Tanácsa, «92/1919. A VKM leiratának véleményezésével a tanács Fináczy Ernő tanácstagot bízza meg» [The request of the MRPE was delegated to the council member of Ernő Fináczy], Budapest, 17<sup>th</sup> December 1919, 15/b 4 Fund, Napló [Registry of the Teacher Training Institution], 1906-1921, AELU.

pedagogy, in earlier periods of his career he also served in the MRPE in various positions, which made him the right candidate to give a professional assessment from the ministerial decree. The council discussed the measures taken by the ministry and the report on it on 22<sup>nd</sup> December 1919.65 In the final report about the case, the director outlined the supportive attitude of both Fináczy and the rest of the council towards the motion of the ministry. Still, a barrier was mentioned, which prevented the implementation of the planned courses. The current legal and teacher examination regulations back then made it possible to apply for the state examination without the rule of mandatory membership in the teacher training institution. Thus, intruding into the curriculum of the institution could have been in vain since only a small proportion of the secondary teacher candidates would have visited these newly introduced courses.66

Avoiding the implementation of the courses just underlines the fact that the council noticed the political intentions behind the motion and wished to ensure the curriculum remained intact. To achieve this aim, the authoritativeness of the council compounded by the scientific achievements and political experience of Fináczy was put behind the refusal of the request of the ministry. The defiance of the teacher training institution perplexed the MRPE and sent the motion between its departments to invent new ways of exercising control over the views of the teacher candidates.<sup>67</sup>

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>65</sup> A Tanárképző Intézet elnöksége, «95-102/1919. A tanárképző intézet tanácsának 1919. december 22-i ülése» [Session of the council of the teacher training institution on 22<sup>nd</sup> December 1919], Budapest, 22<sup>nd</sup> December 1919. 15/b 4 Fund, Napló [Registry of the Teacher Training Institution], 1906-1921, AELU.

Petz Gedeon a középiskolai tanárképző intézet igazgatója, «109/1919. Levél a VKM-miniszterhez a tanárjelöltek közgazdasági és társadalomtudományi képzéséről» [Report of Gedeon Petz on the sociological and economic training of the teacher candidates], Budapest, 23rd December 1919, K 592 Fund, 31 Bunch, 25 Title (1919), NAH.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>67</sup> The proposal was sent from the 4th to the 5th departement of the MRPE and then to the presidential department only to finally remain incomplete. VKM, «213.989/1919. B.I. Szociológai és közgazdaságtani órák bevezetése a budapesti középiskoli tanárképző intézetben» [Decree of the MRPE related to the introduction of social and economic classes for teacher candidates in the teacher training institute of Budapest], Budapest, 23rd December 1919, K 592 Fund, 31 Bunch, 25 Title (1919), NAH. Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 280-281.

# New measurements in the teacher examination processes and the determination of the reform of the teacher examination regulations

Since the intention of scrutinizing the political behaviour and views of all teacher candidates remained unfulfilled, the MRPE found new ways to pursue its intentions. In January 1920, the president of the Teacher Examination Committee in Debrecen reported that the directorate of the committee accepted a motion introduced by a senior member. It related to the interrogation of teacher candidates about their behaviour during the communist dictatorship and their national sentiments. According to the proposal, the inquiry took place between passing the state examination and getting the graduation certificates.68 The idea of the proposal of the Committee in Debrecen was to prevent communist or politically untrustworthy candidates from being employed in secondary schools. The philosophy faculty in Debrecen was way smaller than in the capital in terms of the number of students, therefore, professors knew the personal background of their students. From the circumstances of the approval of the motion, it was obvious that the regional committee reported this measure to the ministry due to the intention of using this punitive measure locally against candidates involved in political activities during the revolutionary period.

In the higher education affairs department of the MRPE, it was recognized that the proposal of the Committee in Debrecen serves as a good pretext to renew the intentions that could not be fulfilled a few months earlier in the case of the teacher training institute. Therefore, the proposal was forwarded to the Committee in Budapest requesting a professional assessment.<sup>69</sup> The president of the Committee in the capital, Zsolt Beöthy reported that the Committee would not pose any plea against the

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>68</sup> Láng Nándor a debreceni m. kir. középiskolai tanárvizsgáló bizottság elnöke, «4/1920. Levél a VKM-miniszterhez» [Nándor Láng the president of the Teacher Examination Committee in Debrecen reports an accepted motion of the directorate of the Committee], Debrecen, 21st January 1920, K 592 Fund, 143 Bunch, 19 Title (1920), NAH.

<sup>69</sup> VKM, «27.562/1920.B. XVI. sz. Leirat a budapesti tanárvizsgáló bizottságnak a debreceni tanárvizsgáló bizottság javaslatának véleményezése ügyében a tanárjelöltek politikai magatartásárának és nemzethűségének ellenőrzéséről» [The MRPE asks the professional assessment of the Teacher Examination Committee in Budapest about the proposal of the Committee in Debrecen regarding the interrogation of teacher candidates about the political behaviour and national sentiments], Budapest, 31st March 1920, K 592 Fund, 143 Bunch, 19 Title (1920), NAH.

planned measure of their counterparts in Debrecen. In fact, Beöthy confessed that they had their own process of ensuring the participation of the right candidates on the state exams.

He described a dubious practice, during which names of the students who were invited to the state exams were published in several locations of the philosophy faculty before the exams. Peers could report and even indict each other if they believe that the invited candidates were involved in suspicious activities. In case of an indictment, the committee could suspend the examination process temporarily or ban the candite suspect from the state exam permanently. 70 After assessing the report of the Committee in Budapest, the MRPE not only recognized the existing practices of screening out undesirable candidates before the state exams but it also coerced the Committees to deny handing out the diplomas to those candidates who proved to be "disloyal to their nation".71 This coercion later became a permanent part of the Teacher Examination Regulations after the reform initiatives in the early 1920s and 1930s.72 Thus, the examination committees had to investigate not only the theoretical and practical preparedness of the candidates but also their political views. The political interrogation of the candidates was outside the operational scope of the professional institutions which fundamentally reveals the transformation of the social reality after the war.

The alteration of the social circumstances also reversed the balance between the professional groups and the state. The political pressure concerning the scrutiny of the views and the behaviour of teacher candidates clearly indicated the dawn of a new social reality. The beginning of a new era between the connections of the MRPE and the professional

Peöthy Zsolt a budapesti országos középiskolai tanárvizsgáló bizottság elnöke, «593/1920. Levél a VKM-miniszterhez a debreceni bizottság előterjesztésének véleményezéséről» [Zsolt Beöthy, the president of the Teacher Examination Committee in Budapest reports about the proposal of the Committee in Debrecen to MRPE], Budapest, 19th April 1920, K 592 Fund, 143 Bunch, 19 Title (1920), NAH.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>71</sup> VKM-miniszter, «104.649/1920.V. Rendelet a budapesti országos tanárvizsgáló elnökségének a tanárjelöltek tanácskormány idején tanúsított magatartásának megvizsgálásáról, igazolóbizottság alakításáról» [Decree of the MRPE to the directorate of the Teacher Examination Committee in Budapest about the interrogation of teacher candidates and establishment of committees carrying out interrogations], Budapest, 18th April 1920, 14/e Fund, 3 Box, 1 dossier, AELU.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>72</sup> [Sine nomine], «Javaslat a Középiskolai Tanárvizsgálati Szabályzat módosítása tárgyában» [Proposal of the new Teacher Examination Regulations], 1925. 11.§., 14/e Fund, 11 Box, AELU.

institutions was also underlined by the developments related to the reform initiatives of the teacher examination regulations.

After Zsolt Beöthy was replaced by József Szinnyei<sup>73</sup> as the president of the teacher examination committee, <sup>74</sup> reforms related to the teacher examination regulations began. Szinnyei declared that he had sworn in his office led by the intention of facilitating the reforms of the regulations. Its previous version was implemented in 1888 and all the teacher examination committees regarded it outdated even before the war.<sup>75</sup> Since the regulations determined the structures of the state exams, the general requirements in each part of the exam process and even the text of the qualification degree, these regulations basically shaped the performance and operation of the whole secondary teacher profession. Consequently, its amendment should have been preserved in the realm of professional competency.

In the transformed social circumstances, in which the MRPE interfered in the personal, curricular, and even qualification processes of the professional institutions, the reform initiatives of the regulations were also influenced by the ministry. The four teacher examination committees were expected to renew the regulations along 12 points set out by the MRPE in May 1921. Some of them related to the identification of deficiencies in the teacher training such as the lack of methodological materials or the need of regulating the practice of the candidates. However, the 4th and the 5th points made clear that the government intended to make membership of the teacher training institution compulsory for all candidates and the certificate of participating in the courses of the institution had to be submitted to the examination committees as a

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>73</sup> Szinnyei was the full professors of comparative linguistics of Ural-Altaic related languages and gained a professorship in 1893/1894 in Budapest. He was employed both in the teacher training institute and in the teacher examination committee. Garai, *A középiskolai tanári professzió*, 170.

VKM, «109.696/1920. V. augusztus 2. A budapesti országos középiskolai tanárvizsgáló bizottság elnöke és tagjainak az 1919/1920 tanévvel kezdődő további öt év tartamára leendő kinevezése tárgyában» [Nomination of the members of the Secondary Teacher Examination Committee in Budapest for 5-year period begins in 1919/1920], K 592 Fund, 172 Bunch, 19 Title (1921), NAH.

Szinnyei József a budapesti országos középiskolai tanárvizsgáló bizottság elnöke, «Tv. 81./1923-1924. Felterjesztés a tanárvizsgálati Szabályzat módosítása tárgyában» [The submission of József Szinnyei, the president of the Teacher Examination Committee related to the reform of the Teacher Examination Regulations], Budapest, August 1923, K 636 Fund, 197 Box, 30 Title (1925), NAH.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>76</sup> VKM, «5725/921. V. ü. o. Rendelet a középiskolai tanárképzés reformjáról» [Decree of the MRPE on the reform of the secondary teacher training], 1-3, 10-12. Budapest, 14<sup>th</sup> May 1921, 14/e Fund, 11 Box, AELU.

prerequisite of applying for state exams. A similar conceptual shift could be registered in the 8<sup>th</sup> point, in which the importance of physical education<sup>77</sup> of the teacher candidates during their preparation time for their profession was outlined.<sup>78</sup>

Determining the reform initiatives of the teacher examination regulations made it obvious that the MRPE conceived the operation of the professional institutions differently in the new social reality after the war. The professional-related affairs could not be maintained and regulated only by the professionals, but the state also wished to pursue its interests even if it resulted in obvious defiance from the professional entities or significant achievements in personal appointments or conceptual determination of the system of the training. For both the ministry and the professional institutions, the early 1920s could be perceived as the period of gaining experience of the consequences of the transformed social reality. The professional organizations wanted to continue their operation as it was before the war to fulfil their aims. On the contrary, the MRPE was bent on tailoring some elements of their activities to meet the requirements of the altered reality after the revolutions. The question for the professional institutions, however, became very clear from the early period of this process: how long could the operation of the professional institutions be preserved under constant pressure from state entities?

## **SUMMARY**

Throughout this paper, an ongoing research is presented, which could be characterised as a deductive and idiographic investigation focusing on

mentioning the physical education could be regarded as a major conceptual shift at least from two aspects. First, the teacher training institutions and even universities lacked the necessary facilities for physical education. Second, physical education was an extraordinary subject in secondary schools and, therefore, their teachers were trained in different high schools and qualified by different examination committees. From the motion of the ministry, it was not clear how could physical education related anyhow to the matter of the training and qualification of secondary school teachers. It can be assumed that its mentioning had ideological reasons. In the new situation of the country after the lost war, physical education obtained a significant importance to regain the capability of self-defence. For that reason, the MRPE launched several programs throughout the country, which enhanced the military capabilities deemed necessary for schoolboys. Physical education of teachers could be envisaged as part of these programs. Romsics, *Magyarország története*, 182.

VKM, «5725/921. V. ü. o. Rendelet a középiskolai tanárképzés reformjáról» [Decree of the MRPE about the reform of secondary teacher training], 4-5, 8. Budapest, 14th May 1921, 14/e Fund, 11 Box, AELU.

three major aspects. Out of the three questions, the connections between the professional entities and the MRPE in the early 1920s were shown by employing the methods of archival source analysis and secondary literature reviews as primary ways of interpreting the sources.

The development of the professional institutions of the secondary teacher training began in the late 1840s and lasted all over the century. During this evolvement theoretical parts of the training were separated from the practical preparation of candidates and institutional examples from Germany and France were implemented in the Hungarian context to provide a systematic preparation for the teachers to fulfil their duty. Despite the efforts of the ministry and professionals, less than 20% of the students were given standardized education, which accounted for the high ratio of failed exams before the teacher examination committees responsible for qualifying teachers.

The consequences of the Great War paralyzed the social system including the professional institutions. The length of both the theoretical and practical preparations was reduced significantly. Furthermore, the short-lived communist dictatorship centralized the teacher training institutions under the direction of the Secondary Teacher Training College. In the institution, newly implemented subjects were introduced with the aim of ideological indoctrination of the teacher candidates. Moreover, the teacher qualification was transformed significantly since all written exams and the necessity of writing a thesis were revoked. Even the structure of the exam was altered by abolishing pedagogical exams. All these changes were driven by the ambition of demolishing the "scholar teacher training" concept.

From the early 1920s, two-two cases were analyzed related to the Secondary Teacher Training Institution and the Teacher Examination Committee in Budapest. In the case of the teacher training institution, the appointment of the president and the introduction of new compulsory classes obviously showed the efforts of the MRPE to intrude into the inner affairs of the professional organization. Although Remig Békefi was a recognized scholar, his appointment as president expressed the intention of the MRPE to reshape the secular character of the institute. A political motive was also clearly expressed in the motion of the ministry aiming at introducing obligatory subjects for all candidates. The leadership of the institution recognized the obvious political intentions

and prevented the ministry from intruding into the curriculum by referring to legal shortcomings.

After having encountered opposition from the council of the teacher training institute, the ministry found new ways into exerting control over the political views of the teacher candidates. Committees were entitled to scrutinize the political behaviour of the teacher aspirants. In 1920, the committee of Debrecen requested the ministry to be entitled to refuse handing out diplomas for those who were involved in the political activities of the communist regime. Originally, the request was made for planned punitive measures against local students, however, the MRPE extended this right to all committees intending to screen out candidates who did not seem to be comfortable with the ideology of the new era.

Additionally, the MRPE took care by determining the reform initiatives of the teacher examination regulations to influence the professional qualification and thus the operation of the professional institutions in the long term. In the case of previous renewals of the teacher examination regulations, professional institutions set out the cornerstones of the reforms. As an indicator of the transformed relationship between the ministry and the professional institutions, the MRPE announced the key points of the renewal process, which also contained conceptual shifts in the training. Prescribing the mandatory membership of the teacher training institutions and emphasizing the importance of the physical education of the teacher candidates set the "scholar teacher training" concept on a gradual descending trajectory.

The intentions of the ministry were affected by the circumstances, into which the end of the war drove the country. After the lost war, a new social and economic structure have to be created to maintain the functionality of the remaining parts of the country. Therefore, politicians had to be convinced that several aspects of social life have to be set on a new course including professional institutions. This led to ministerial activity, which ignored the previously established connection based on mutual cooperation between the government entities and the professional institutions. Perception of affairs previously regarded as internal matters of the professional institutions had changed and thus raised the interest of politicians. This new relationship between the MRPE and the professional institutions

did not lead to an immediate deprofessionalization but it certainly eroded the social distinctiveness of professionals derived from their expertise.

Regarding the relations between the professionals and the executive branch of the state, the Hungarian developments could be characterised as unprecedented compared with the countries in the Central and Eastern European region in the early 1920s. State initiatives were also prevalent in other countries of the region that aimed at restructuring previously emerged professional institutions. In Germany, professionals could withstand the attempts of degrading the previously achieved social positions of secondary teachers and maintained the institutional settings of their training in the era of the Weimar Republic. 79 Moreover, the Austrian Christian-socialist-led education ministry implemented structural reforms of the training but these measures were implemented by the contribution of professionals. 80 In the newly emerged countries in the region, governments tended to reorganise the professional training of teachers to ease the territorial differences. These initiatives of setting professional development on a new course also resulted in dismissing professionals inherited from the period of the Austro-Hungarian Monarchy.81

However, the Hungarian government wanted to slightly modify the structure of the training but aimed at implementing significant changes in the inner operation of professional institutions. This intention could be traced back to two reasons. First, the political-economic collapse of the Monarchy and the short-lived revolutionary regimes between 1918-1919 had shaken the whole of Hungarian society. Consequently, the institutional structure and any changes implemented in the revolutionary period cannot be maintained after 1920. Secondly, professionals were deemed suspiciously as the remnants of the fallen liberal political and social era who had to be aligned with the new political order. Since the Horthy-regime could be labelled as a parliamentary political system with authoritarian elements due to the lack of equal conditions for the political parties in the political contests, 82 representatives of the regime

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>79</sup> McClelland, The German experience, 210-213.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>80</sup> Grimm, Bali and Pirka, «Leherbildung in Österreich», 98-99.

 $<sup>^{81}</sup>$  See Livezeneau, Cultural politics, 218-219., Protner, Medves and Batinic et al., «The Development of Teacher», 243-244.

<sup>82</sup> Romsics, Magyarország története, 235.

felt necessary to ensure the political stability by exerting a certain level of control over professional institutions that were manifested in the form of renewal attempts of state interventions.

#### REFERENCES

- Babbie, Earl. *A társadalomtudományi kutatás gyakorlata* [The Practice of Social Research]. Budapest: Balassi Kiadó, 2008.
- Betti, Emilio. «A hermeneutika mint a szellemtudományok általános módszertana» [Hermeneutics as a general method of history of ideals]. *Athenaeum* 1, no. 2 (1992): 3-52.
- Bourdoncle, Raymond, and Andre Robert. «Primary and secondary school teachers in France: changes in identities and professionalization». *Journal of Education Policy* 15, no. 1 (2000): 71-81.
- Evetts, Julia. «The sociological analysis of professionalism. Occupational change in the modern world». *International Sociology* 18, no. 2 (2003): 395-415.
- Friedson, Elliot. Professionalism. The third logic. Cambridge: Polity Press, 2001.
- Garai, Imre. An elite teacher training institute. The history of Eötvös József Collegium, 1895-1950. Budapest: ELTE Eötvös College, 2019.
- Garai, Imre. A középiskolai tanári professzió intézményesülésének folyamatai. A tanárvizsgáló bizottság és a tanárképző intézet működése a pesti tudományegyetemen az 1862-1919 közötti időszakban [Professionalization Processes of the Secondary School Teacher Profession. Operation of the Secondary Teacher Examination Committee and the Teacher Training Institute of the University of Pest, 1862-1919]. Budapest: ELTE Eötvös College, 2022.
- Gogu, Emilia, Corina-Cristina Bozdugan and Daniela Nenciu. «Profile of the Romanian Upper Schooling During the Interwar Period». *Fiat Iustitia* 12, no. 2 (2018): 82-95. https://ideas.repec.org/a/dcu/journl/v12y2018i2p81-95. html
- Grimm, Gerald, Beáta Bali, and Veronika Pirka. «Leherbildung in Österreich Aspekte ihrer Genese von den Anfängen im späten 18. Jahrhundert bis zur Zweiten Republik». In *Lehrerbildung in Europa. Geschichte, Struktur und Reform*, edited by Németh András and Ehrenhard Skiera, 91-110. Frankfurt am Main New York: Peter Lang, 2012.
- Gyáni, Gábor. «Magyarország társadalomtörténete a Horthy-korban» [The History of the Hunarian Society in the Horthy-era], In *Magyarország társadalomtörténete a reformkortól a második világháborúig* [The History of the Hungarian Society form the early 19th century to the end of the World War II.]. Edited by Gyáni Gábor and Kövér Gyögy, 187-389. Budapest: Osiris Kiadó, 2006.

- Heidenreich, Martin. «Berufskonstruktion und Professionalisierung. Erträgen soziologischen Forschung», In *Professionalisierung pädagogischen Berufe im historischen Prozeß*. edited by Hans Jürgen Apel, Klaus-Peter Horn, Peter Lundgreen, and Uwe Sandfuchs, 35-58. Bad Heilbrunn: Verlag Julius Klinkhadt, 1999.
- Hesse, Hans Albrecht. Berufe im Wandel: ein Beitrag zum Problem der Professionalisierung Stuttgart: Eke, 1968.
- Hofstetter, Michael J. *The romantic idea of a university*. *England and Germany*, 1770-1850. New York: Palgrave, 2001.
- Horlacher, Rebekka. *The educated subject and the German concept of Bildung. A Cultural History.* New York London: Routledge, 2016.
- Jarausch, Konrad H. *The unfree professions. German lawyers, teachers and engineers, 1800-1950.* New York Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1990.
- Johnson, Terence. *Professions and power*. London New York: MacMillan, 1972.
- Kasper, Tomaš, and Dana Kasperová. «Lehrerbildung in der Tsechischen Republik historische und aktuelle Aspekte». In *Lehrerbildung in Europa. Geschichte, Struktur und Reform,* edited by Németh, András & Skiera, Ehrenhard, 219-239. Frankfurt am Main New York: Peter Lang, 2012.
- Kéri, Katalin. *Bevezetés a neveléstörténeti kutatások módszertanába* [Introduction to Methodology of Research Activities in the Discipline of History of Education]. Budapest: Műszaki Könyvkiadó, 2001.
- Kiss, Istvánné. *Szemelvények a budapesti egyetemi tanárképző intézet gyakorlógim-náziumának jegyzőkönyveiből (1924-1944)* [Extrats from the Minutes of the Secondary Practicing School of the Teacher Training Institute of the University of Pest (1924-1944)]. Budapest: Országos Pedagógiai Könyvtár és Múzeum, 1991.
- Ladányi, Andor. *A középiskolai tanárképzés története* [History of the Secondary School Teachers]. Budapest: Új Mandátum Kiadó, 2008.
- Larson, Magali Sarfatti. *The rise of professionalism. A sociological analysis*. Berkely: University of California Press, 1977.
- Livezeneau, Irina. *Cultural politics in Greater Romania. Regionalism, nation building & ethnic struggle, 1918-1930.* Ithaca and London: Cornell University Press, 2000.
- Lundgreen, Peter. «Berufskonstruktion und Professionalisierung in historische Perspektive». In *Professionalisierung pädagogischen Berufe im historischen Prozeβ*, edited by Hans Jürgen Apel, Klaus-Peter Horn, Peter Lundgreen & Uwe Sandfuchs, 19-34. Bad Heilbrunn: Verlag Julius Klinkhadt, 1999.
- McClelland, Charles E. *The German experience of professionalization. Modern learned professions and their organizations from the early nineteenth century to the Hitler era.* Cambridge - New York - Sydney: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- Nagy, Péter Tibor. «Az állami befolyás növekedése a magyarországi oktatásban (1867-1945)» [The Increase of the State Influence on the Education in

- Hungary (1867-1945)] (Academic Doctoral Thesis, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, 2003).
- Németh, András. *Magyar pedagógusképzés és szakmai tudásformák I. 1775-1945. Nemzeti fejlődési trendek, nemzetközi recepciós hatások* [Training of Pedagogues and their Professional Knowlede in Hungary I. 1775-1945. National Trends of Development and Reception of International Tendencies]. Budapest: ELTE Eötvös Kiadó, 2012.
- Pál, Hatos. *Az elátkozott köztársaság*. Az 1918-as összeomlás és az őszirózsás forradalom története [The Sick Republic. The History of the Collapse in 1918 and the Democratic Revolution]. Budapest: Jaffa Kiadó, 2018.
- Parsons, Talcott. «The professions and social structure». In *Essays in sociological theory*, edited by Talcott Parsons, 34-50. London: Macmillan, 1955.
- Protner, Edvard, Zdenko Medves, Stefka Batinic, et al. «The Development of Teacher Training in the Stats of Former Yugoslavia». In *Lehrerbildung in Europa. Geschichte, Struktur und Reform*, edited by András Németh and Ehrenhard Skiera, 237-265. Frankfurt am Main New York: Peter Lang, 2012.
- Pornói, Imre. «Az 1920-as évek Népoktatása és a nyolcosztályos népiskola Magyarországon» [Public Elementary Schooling in the 1920s and the Implementation of 8-grade Elementary Schools in Hungary]. *Magyar Pedagógia* 95, no. 3-4 (1995): 315-331.
- Pukánszky, Béla. «A tanárképző intézet szerepének alakulása a magyarországi tanárképzés történetében» [The Role of the Teacher Training Institute in the History of the Hungarian Teacher Training], *Pedagógusképzés* 10-11, no. 39-40 (2013): 73-91.
- Romsics, Ignác. *Magyarország története a XX. században* [The History of Hungary in the 20th century]. Budapest: Osiris Kiadó, 2004.
- Sandfuchs, Uwe. «Die Lehrerbildung in Deutschland Geschichte, Struktur und Reform». In *Lehrerbildung in Europa. Geschichte, Struktur und Reform*, edited by András Németh and Ehrenhard Skiera, 59-72. Frankfurt am Main New York: Peter Lang, 2012.
- Szentpétery, Imre. *A királyi magyar Pázmány Péter Tudományegyetem története. Vol.* 4. *A bölcsészettudományi kar története, 1635-1935* [The History of the Royal Hungarian Péter Pázmány University. Vol. 4. The History of the Philosophy Faculty, 1635-1935]. Budapest: Királyi Magyar Egyetemi Nyomda. 1935.
- Veress, Károly. *Bevezetés a hermeneutikába* [Introduction to Hermeneutics]. Budapest: L'Harmattan Magyar Daseinanalitikai Egyesület, 2019.
- Willing, Carla. «Interpretation and analysis». In *The Sage Handbook of Qualitative Data Analysis*, edited by Uwe Flick, 136-150. London Washington: Sage, 2014.